

Cranborne Star Pension Scheme (“the Scheme”)

Annual Governance Statement by the Chair of the Trustee for the Scheme Year Ending on 31 May 2020

Introduction and background

This statement has been prepared in accordance with regulation 23 the Occupational Pension Scheme (Scheme Administration) Regulations 1996, as amended (the “Administration Regulations”), and related Pensions Regulator guidance.

It relates to the Cranborne Star Pension Scheme (the “Scheme”).

Consideration has also been given to the Pensions Regulator’s ‘A quick guide to the chair’s statement’ and to the Department for Work and Pensions guide on ‘Reporting of costs, charges and other information’, both published in September 2018.

Matters in relation to the Scheme are considered by a dedicated committee of the Dalriada Board which meets at least four times a year. However, issues are also considered on an ad hoc basis between committee meetings and the Scheme has a dedicated client manager, alongside a project manager, who ensures anything requiring attention by the committee is communicated, and acted upon, in a timely manner.

As you are aware from the Announcements issued to members since its appointment, Dalriada Trustees Limited (“Dalriada”) was appointed as trustee to the Scheme by the Pensions Regulator amid concerns that the Scheme was being used as a vehicle for pension liberation. This has presented Dalriada with a number of challenges around governance. Nevertheless this statement is a legal requirement and, as such, can serve as a useful reminder of the issues faced by Dalriada and, where it cannot meet certain governance obligations, I have explained why that it is the case.

Whilst the previous trustees were not removed by the Pensions Regulator, Dalriada Trustees Limited (Dalriada) was appointed with exclusive powers so Dalriada is, effectively, the sole trustee of the Scheme.

The Scheme was used, principally, as a vehicle to allow members under the minimum retirement age of 55 to access cash payments. Under the wrapper of a ‘Maximising Pension Value Arrangement’ (MPVA), members of the Scheme received an unsecured loan (or loans) from other pension schemes, similarly established. In turn, and, again, using the MPVA wrapper, the previous trustee effected a number of unsecured loans to members of those other pension schemes.

Subsequent to its appointment, Dalriada did not make any further MPVA payments and sought direction from the Court regarding the status of the MPVA loans already in place. A judgment handed down on 16 December 2011 found that the MPVA loans were unauthorised member payments and in breach of the trustee’s powers of investment.

HMRC also considers the MPVA loans to be unauthorised payments and, as a result, HMRC has issued provisional tax assessments against both the Scheme and its members. These provisional assessments are significant and have been appealed by the majority of members and by Dalriada respectively. The correct basis for taxation will only be established at the end of the appeal process, to be run through the Tax Tribunal (equivalent to the Court for matters relating to tax).

Over the course of the scheme year, Dalriada has continued to work with its legal advisers and HMRC to prepare for the appeal hearing in the Tax Tribunal.

In addition to the loans made to members of other schemes, the Scheme made a number of inappropriate investments which have now been recovered.

Default arrangement

A number of requirements of the Administration Regulations, which are referred to in this statement, relate only to a “default arrangement” as defined in the Occupational Pension Schemes (Charges and Governance) Regulations 2015. The Scheme does not have a default fund for ongoing accrual. It is not a qualifying scheme within the meaning given by section 99 of the Pensions Act 2008. It is not used to meet any auto-enrolment obligations and no contributions are being paid into the Scheme.

The Scheme did not offer a Default Lifestyle Strategy.

The Scheme did not offer members any choice as to how their funds were invested. In Dalriada’s view, there has never been an appropriate default investment arrangement. There is no life-styling option available.

Alongside the MPVA loans made to members of other schemes, funds were invested in unusual and high risk, unregulated investments.

One such investment was South Horizon Trading Limited (South Horizon), based in Cyprus. Ultimately, Dalriada reached an agreement with South Horizon that resulted in the full return of funds, plus interest, to the Scheme.

The Scheme also invested in Entrepreneur Capital Holdings, a company based in the British Virgin Islands. The invested funds were subsequently recovered in full, with interest, by Dalriada.

Finally, the Scheme further invested in a property company based in Guernsey, Affinity Commercial LLP (previously ROM Capital Asset Management Limited). Dalriada has now negotiated settlement terms with Affinity and the full amount invested has been paid back to the Scheme plus an allowance for interest.

All recovered funds are held in cash. The previous trustees made investment decisions without seeking appropriate investment advice.

Statement of Investment Principles

Ordinarily, trustees should prepare a Statement of Investment Principles governing decisions about investments.

No serviceable Statement of Investment Principles exists for the Scheme.

Once it has identified what assets are recoverable, Dalriada will take appropriate advice to determine a suitable investment strategy and put in place a suitable Statement of Investment Principles.

Ultimately, it is Dalriada's intention to wind up the Scheme as soon as it is able, giving members the opportunity to transfer any remaining funds to a more suitable arrangement of their choice.

A copy of this Statement is accessible to members on a website:

www.dalriadatrustees.co.uk/ark

This information will also be confirmed in future member Announcements.

Review of default strategy and default arrangements

As commented above, no serviceable Statement of Investment Principles exists for the Scheme.

Dalriada has taken appropriate advice to determine a suitable investment strategy for the ongoing investment of funds currently held in cash. It will look to implement that strategy over the course of the next scheme year and, also, put in place a suitable Statement of Investment Principles.

Due to the issues still facing the Scheme, principally the uncertainty surrounding taxation, the Scheme has adopted a low risk investment strategy to date and will continue do so.

As the investments entered into by the previous trustees as well as the use of MPVA loans were unconventional, they did not comply with any maximum charge requirements.

The Court previously ruled that the MPVA loans were made in breach of trust and were not validly made. As trustee of the Scheme, Dalriada has a duty to recover any of the Scheme's assets paid out in breach of trust and this would include funds paid by way of MPVA loans. Dalriada sought direction from the Court as to the approach it should take with regard to the recovery of the MPVA loans and, following a hearing in the summer of 2017, is now looking to recover the loans accordingly. At this stage, some loans have been recovered but Dalriada now needs to go back to Court for further direction on the next stages of recovery of the loans.

Ultimately, it is Dalriada's intention to wind up the Scheme as soon as it is able, giving members the opportunity to transfer any funds to a more suitable arrangement of their choice. However, it is likely that it will still be some time before the Scheme can be wound up. Copies of the Scheme's Report and Accounts are published on the members' website.

Core Financial Transactions

Trustees have a specific duty to ensure that core financial transactions relating to DC schemes are processed promptly and accurately. These include the following:

- investing contributions in the Scheme
- transferring assets related to members into or out of the Scheme
- transferring the assets between different investments within the Scheme
- making payments from the Scheme to or on behalf of the members.

The Scheme does not currently accept contributions or transfers in and is unable to pay any level of benefit, including transfers values, to members at the present time.

This is due to a number of factors, not least uncertainty, to date, as to the value of the Scheme's investments and the position with regard to the potential tax charges mentioned above. More information on this has been provided in Dalriada's Announcements to members.

The Financial Transactions the Scheme does make are, in the main, in relation to costs. These are reported in the Scheme's annual accounts.

Given its inability to carry out routine administrative actions, unsurprisingly, over the reporting period, there have been no material administration service issues which need to be reported here by Dalriada.

Notwithstanding this, Dalriada, as a professional Independent Trustee, has processes and controls in place that are suitably designed to ensure any service objectives can be achieved once the Scheme is in a position to operate in the manner of a normal scheme. Dalriada's administration processes are independently audited and accredited under AAF 01/06 and AAF 02/07.

Once Dalriada is in a position to process member benefit requests these will be managed and monitored in line with Dalriada's standard SLA levels and targets and formally reported on, on a quarterly basis.

In addition, acknowledging that we need accurate member data for the processing of member benefits, Dalriada will carry out an analysis of 'common data' and 'scheme specific data' (as defined by The Pensions Regulator). This helps us to ensure the integrity of member data that is processed.

Where possible, we perform regular bank reconciliations for all Scheme bank accounts. The purpose of these reconciliations is to ensure that all transactions processed through the bank (money in and out) can be accounted for. Any transactions which cannot be accounted for are investigated and corrected if required.

Charges and Transaction Costs

The governance rules require the Trustee to make an assessment of investment management charges and transactions costs borne by the Scheme members and the extent to which those charges and costs represent good value for money for members.

The Trustee has calculated the charges and, so far as they were able to do so, the transaction costs, borne by Scheme members for the Scheme Year.

In this context, "charges" means (subject to some specific exceptions, such as charges relating to pension sharing orders) all administration charges other than transaction costs.

"Transaction costs" are costs incurred as a result of the buying, selling, lending or borrowing of investments.

Dalriada has deviated from the approach set out in the statutory guidance for the reasons set out below.

Since its appointment, there have been no transactions as Dalriada has not accepted any payments into the Scheme, either by way of contribution or transfers in so there have been no transaction costs.

However, under the terms of its appointment, the fees of Dalriada and its advisers are met from Scheme funds. Whilst these costs (or "charges") fall as debt due from the employer (or sponsor), in this case the sponsor was a dormant company with no assets.

Due to the mismanagement of the Scheme by its previous trustees and the subsequent actions taken by Dalriada since appointment, it is inevitable that the Scheme has incurred, and will continue to incur, significantly higher ongoing costs than would be the case for a similarly sized but conventional scheme.

These costs for the year ending 31 May 2020 are set in the Accounts and total £89,112.

"Good value" assessment of charges and transactions

Generally, trustees should assess the extent to which the charges described above represent "good value" for members during the scheme year, by considering the level of member borne charges against the benefits attributable to such charges.

Whether something represents "good value" is not capable of being precisely defined, but for these purposes, trustees should consider that charges may be viewed as representing "good value" for members where an optimum combination of cost and quality is achieved for the membership as a whole, relative to other options available in the market.

The characteristics of the Scheme are unusual and there are no readily available comparators to determine whether the costs incurred represent good value.

However, the actions undertaken by Dalriada, beyond those considered necessary for the appropriate management of the Scheme, are centred on legal action around recovery of funds. Such actions are considered on a cost benefit analysis and, where necessary, Court approval is sought for the use of Scheme funds to pay for such legal action.

Dalriada was appointed following a tender exercise by the Pensions Regulator (TPR) and Dalriada is subject to ongoing oversight by TPR.

Dalriada's costs (both for ongoing management and with regard to action around recovery of funds) are calculated using a blended charging rate that sits well below its standard market rates. Its legal advisers operate similarly.

As commented above, Dalriada, as a professional Independent Trustee, has processes and controls in place that are suitably designed to ensure any service objectives can be achieved once the Scheme is in a position to operate in the manner of a normal scheme. Dalriada's administration processes are independently audited and accredited under AAF 01/06 and AAF 02/07.

Once Dalriada is in a position to process member benefit requests these will be managed and monitored in line with Dalriada's standard SLA levels and targets and formally reported on, on a quarterly basis.

In relation to the cumulative effect over time of the application of charges and costs on the value of a member's accrued rights to money purchase benefits, due to the nature of Dalriada's appointment, both Dalriada's and its adviser's fees are met using Scheme funds. Given that we are not in a position to determine the value of the Scheme's assets it is not possible to say what the cumulative effect of these costs is, generally, on members' accrued rights.

As soon as Dalriada is in a position to identify each individual's asset allocation, Dalriada will be able to determine the impact of costs on the value of members' benefits.

Trustee knowledge and understanding

The Trustee has considered the latest guidance in relation to Chairman's Statements from The Pensions Regulator and has ensured that its practices reflect the requirements set out. I have set out below how the Trustee ensures it currently meets the knowledge and understanding requirements of trustees.

Dalriada is an independent professional trustee, established in 2003, which has been appointed by The Pensions Regulator under section 7 of the Pensions Act 1995 to a number of schemes as a result of The Pensions Regulator having concerns about the nature and operation of those schemes and the extent to which the then current trustees understood their statutory and fiduciary duties and responsibilities. Dalriada refers to such schemes as "Regulatory Appointments". The Scheme is a Regulatory Appointment.

Dalriada has established a specialist team drawn from various relevant disciplines within Dalriada to manage the governance of these Regulatory Appointments which we have called the Irregular Schemes Team.

A dedicated committee (the Irregular Schemes Committee – 'the Committee') has been established by the Board of Directors of Dalriada to oversee the activities of the Irregular Schemes Team in its governance of this Scheme and other Regulatory Appointments. Care has been taken to ensure that the membership of the Committee is such that there is sufficient knowledge and understanding within the Committee to meet the requirements set out in sections 247 and 248 of the Pensions Act 2004 and The Pensions Regulator's Code of Practice 7 on Trustee Knowledge and Understanding.

I have set out below the membership of the Committee, along with a short note on their skill set and experience. In addition, it is worth noting that three members of the Committee are directors of Dalriada Trustees Limited. Dalriada operates a team based approach which gives the Regulatory Appointments Team access to over 120 pensions and support personnel with a broad skill set suited to identifying and implementing the variety of tasks required to successfully manage the Scheme, including pension administration experts, an in house legal team, fund accountants and investment experts. Whilst the core Irregular Schemes Team deals with the majority of matters arising on the Scheme on a day to day basis, in conjunction with its appointed advisers, it can access the specialist expertise of the wider Dalriada team as and when required.

As far as we are aware, no other professional independent trustee firm has established and developed a specialist team in this difficult and challenging area of trusteeship. The relevant experience developed by the Irregular Schemes Team on such cases is unmatched and unrivalled.

The Committee

Sean Browes

Sean has been working in the pensions industry since he graduated in 1988. He worked for two major benefit consultancies in both administration management and consultancy roles, before joining Dalriada in 2003. Sean has a broad range of skills and experience suited to all areas of pension scheme management.

Sean leads the Irregular Schemes Team, dealing with Dalriada's appointments by The Pensions Regulator to schemes suspected of being involved in pension liberation or thought to be scams. He now has a wealth of experience and knowledge with regard to the unique characteristics associated with the administration and management of these types of scheme and the challenges they present.

Sean is a fully accredited member of the Association of Professional Pension Trustees, has completed the Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and holds the Pensions Management Institute's Certificate in DC Governance and Award in Pension Trusteeship (DC and DB). Sean has met all required CPD requirements.

Neil Copeland

Neil is a co-founder and director of Dalriada Trustees Limited. He acts as an Accredited Professional Trustee on some of our most complex and challenging cases, including our regulatory appointments. Neil specialises in schemes with technically challenging governance and covenant issues, as well as having over 25 years of experience in relation to defined benefit, hybrid, defined contribution, multi-employer and sectionalised arrangements.

Neil is the Dalriada Board representative for the Irregular Schemes Team and spends a significant proportion of his time working on Regulatory Appointments. Like Sean, Neil has developed considerable experience of the complex and non-standard issues faced by the Dalriada team in managing the Regulatory Appointments. This has included acting as a witness in high profile litigation in relation to Regulatory Appointments in support of The Pensions Regulator and representing Dalriada in oral hearings before the Determinations Panel where Dalriada's appointment by The Pensions Regulator has been challenged by the incumbent trustees or other directly affected parties.

Neil is a fully accredited member of the Association of Professional Pension Trustees, has completed the Pensions Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and holds the Pensions Management Institute's Award in Pension Trusteeship (DC and DB). Neil has met all required CPD requirements.

Tom Lukic

Tom is also a director of Dalriada Trustees Limited and leads the Dalriada business across the Midlands. He has broad pensions experience with particular expertise in employer covenant and corporate transactions. He has worked with a range of trustee boards managing scheme assets from c£5 million to more than £1 billion. Similarly, he is experienced in working with a broad spectrum of sponsoring employers from small, owner managed businesses through to much larger and complex groups being either privately owned or fully listed.

Tom's experience, both as an adviser and as an Accredited Professional Trustee, provides particular insight into corporate structures and insolvencies. Where the Scheme's investments include shares and/or bonds in, or issued by, corporate entities understanding the accounting and financial structures of these entities is essential and Tom provides a wealth of experience in this area.

Tom is a fully accredited member of the Association of Professional Pension Trustees, has completed the Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and holds the Pensions Management Institute's Award in Pension Trusteeship (DC and DB). Tom has met all required CPD requirements.

Brian Spence

Brian is a co-founder and director of Dalriada Trustees Limited. He is now involved in the provision of a wide range of advice to pension scheme sponsors and trustees. Brian is well-known in the pensions industry for taking a strategic view in dealing with pension scheme matters and uses his experience to deliver practical solutions which satisfy the needs of the Trustees, the employers and other stakeholders. Brian is recognised by The Pensions Regulator and the pensions industry as an expert in dealing with contentious and/or complex issues. He is a lead contact and "key person" for a number of high profile trustee appointments.

In addition, Brian has practical experience of working as an Accredited Professional Trustee in all three major legal jurisdictions of the UK and as a Professional Trustee and advisor in Ireland. Brian has held a UK Scheme Actuary Practising Certificate since inception of the role in 1997.

Brian has an in depth knowledge of legal processes, particularly around testing points of legal principle related to the operation of pension schemes, often as a result of deficiencies in scheme documentation (a common issue with Regulatory Appointments) and, also, litigation – where it is cost effective to do so, Dalriada will look to take legal action against the perpetrators of a scam with the aim to recover misappropriated assets.

Brian is a fully accredited member of the Association of Professional Pension Trustees, has completed the Pensions Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and holds the Pensions Management Institute's Award in Pension Trusteeship (DC and DB). Brian has met all required CPD requirements.

Gino Rocco

Gino performs the role of an Accredited Professional Trustee in relation to all aspects of pension law focusing in particular on defined benefit and defined contribution pension schemes that range in size from the small to the very large.

A solicitor admitted to practice in England and Wales and a Member of the Association of Pension Lawyers, Gino has over 15 years' experience gained at City and National Firms as well as a leading pension consultancy practice.

Gino's experience includes complex benefit interpretation issues, scheme equalisation and benefit rectifications. He has detailed experience of pensions issues arising under TUPE transfers and the Fair Deal protections where employees are transferred from the public (in particular LGPS and NHSPS) to the private sector.

Gino is a fully accredited member of the Association of Professional Pension Trustees, has completed the Pensions Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and holds the Pensions Management Institute's Award in Pension Trusteeship (DC and DB). Gino has met all required CPD requirements.

Knowledge of the trust deed and rules and all documents setting out the trustee's current policies

The Scheme has a dedicated client manager who has an in depth knowledge of the Scheme and its governing documentation. At the point of becoming an Independent Trustee to the Scheme, a prescribed take on process was followed. This included an assimilation and review of all the relevant Scheme documentation, including the trust deed and rules. The Committee is made aware of any issues or risks in relation to the Scheme's trust deed and rules as and when they arise and appropriate action agreed in relation to the issue or risk identified. In addition to the knowledge held by the client manager and lead Professional Trustee, the trustees obtain legal advice in relation to the Scheme's documentation, where necessary.

There have been no new trustees introduced in this reporting period. However, there is an appropriate induction process in place to support new trustees.

A working knowledge of the current Statement of Investment Principles (SIP)

As is set out earlier, the Scheme does not have a SIP at this time due to the particular circumstances of the Scheme.

Sufficient knowledge and understanding of the law relating to pensions and trusts and understanding of the principles relating to the funding and investment of occupational schemes

Those Dalriada staff working on the Scheme, including the lead Professional Trustee, are obliged to self evaluate their learning and development requirements on an annual basis as part of Dalriada's internal appraisal process. The process identifies how staff can develop their knowledge and understanding, as well as where they can share their expertise in order to best support the Scheme. Dalriada staff are also required to comply with their respective training requirements in order to maintain a required level of continuing professional education (CPE) and to provide evidence of courses, seminars and other types of professional development to satisfy their respective professional bodies' CPE requirements.

Every Professional Trustee is required to undertake a minimum number of hours training in a year. This is recorded centrally by Dalriada's HR Team and, where appropriate, forms part of staff personal development plans. This training can include internal and external courses and attendance at industry events, as well as a degree of self learning by way of subscriptions to professional publications and electronic information channels.

Further, every Professional Trustee is required to complete The Pensions Regulator's Trustee Toolkit and subscribes to the updates issued by The Pensions Regulator.

Professional Trustees belong to Dalriada's knowledge management network which keeps them up to date with industry thinking. They also have access to a team of in house pensions experts who inform the team about changes to pensions legislation and practices.

The trustees have access to Pendragon Perspective and Aries - both industry leading tools, giving access to pension legislation.

Dalriada has its own in house legal specialists to provide support and guidance to trustees around legislation and interpretation of scheme documentation. This is further aided by advice from external legal advisers, which is obtained when the trustees feel the reinforcement is necessary to support their own understanding.

Combined knowledge and understanding, together with available advice enables the trustees to properly exercise their function

Dalriada has informally assessed the skill set and experience of each member of the Committee and the client team. It has taken into account the development activities already mentioned, along with the internal resources made available to staff, supplemented, where required, by professional external advice.

The Committee understands the need to more formally assess the skills of its members. This is done using a skills matrix developed for this purpose. Any areas for development flagged during this process will be addressed as part of the individual's personal development plan and reviewed throughout the year.

An evaluation of the effectiveness of the Committee as a whole is also carried out.

I consider that the combined knowledge and understanding of the Committee and the client team enables them to exercise properly their function as trustee of the Scheme. In particular:

- Members of the Committee have the relevant financial knowledge and experience to enable the trustee to comply with its duties in relation to investment of the Scheme's assets. Tom Lukic's experience (see above) in particular is advantageous in this area.
- There is a vast range of pensions experience and knowledge within the Committee and the client team. This is appropriate to deal with the governance of the Scheme in line with the trust deed and rules, along with other Scheme documentation. There is also a great deal of experience relevant to dealing with issues which might be thrown up by the Scheme which require the amendment of Scheme documentation.
- Sean Browes, Neil Copeland and Brian Spence have a great deal of knowledge and experience in relation to schemes of complex nature, such as this Scheme, where investments made by previous trustees are deemed to be highly inappropriate, their administration has been poor and / or the trustees have not had the sufficient knowledge and understanding to be trustees of an occupational pension scheme.
- Sean Browes and Neil Copeland have many years of experience in the administration of pension schemes, allowing a keen oversight of the administration of the Scheme.

Member Representation

Dalriada is aware that members of the Scheme are potential victims of a scam. As such, we look to keep members informed and to facilitate direct access for members to Dalriada by means of a:

- Dedicated member website
- Dedicated contact e-mail address

- Dedicated phone line.

Agreed as final version on behalf of the Trustees of the Cranborne Star Pension Scheme

Dated: 21 December 2020

Version: 1